

Minutes of the Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Joint Committee Meeting held in The Council Chamber, Rotorua Lakes Council, Civic Administration Building, 1061 Haupapa Street, Rotorua on Monday, 4 December 2017 commencing at 12.30 p.m.

Present:

Deputy Chairman: Councillor D Love (Bay of Plenty Regional Council (BOPRC))

Members: Deputy Mayor D Donaldson (Alternate, Rotorua Lakes Council (RLC)), Mayor A Bonne (Whakatane District Council (WDC)), Councillor S Browne (Alternate, Opotiki District Council (ODC)), Chairman D Leeder (Alternate, BOPRC), Mayor G Webber (Western Bay of Plenty District Council (WBOPDC))

In Attendance: M Macleod (Chief Executive, BOPRC), D Bewley (General Manager Planning, Regulatory and Corporate Services, WDC), J Hamilton (Consultant, Kestrel Group), C Naude (Director, Emergency Management Bay of Plenty (EMBOP)), G Leonard (Volcanic Geologist, GNS Science), J Durham (Committee Advisor, BOPRC)

Apologies: Mayor G Brownless (Tauranga City Council (TCC)) Mayor J Forbes (ODC), Mayor M Campbell (KDC), Mayor S Chadwick (RLC), G Poole (Chair of Coordinating Executive Group & Chief Executive, TCC)

In Mayor Brownless' absence, Councillor Love assumed the Chair.

1 Apologies

Resolved

That the Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Joint Committee:

- 1 Accepts the apologies of Mayors; G Brownless, S Chadwick, J Forbes, M Campbell, and Mr G Poole tendered at the meeting.

Donaldson/Browne
CARRIED

2 General Business and Tabled Items

Nil.

3 Declaration of conflicts of interest

Nil.

4 Previous Minutes

4.1 Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Joint Committee minutes - 2 June 2017

Resolved

That the Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Joint Committee:

- 1 Confirms the minutes, Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Joint Committee minutes - 2 June 2017 as a true and correct record.

Love/Donaldson
CARRIED

4.2 Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Joint Committee minutes - 18 September 2017

Resolved

That the Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Joint Committee:

- 1 Confirms the minutes, Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Joint Committee minutes - 18 September 2017 as a true and correct record.

Love/Donaldson
CARRIED

5 Reports

5.1 Bay of Plenty Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Review - Sir Michael Cullen

Mary-Anne Macleod (Chief Executive, BOPRC) presented Members with an overview of the Sir Michael Cullen review of the Bay of Plenty Regional Council response (Report) to ex-tropical Cyclone Debbie on 6 April 2017. Ms Macleod outlined the background circumstances leading up to Cyclone Debbie, including:

- Affected locations were situated largely below sea level;
- Residents told the Review Panel that they were unaware they lived in a flood zone;
- Pumps were relied upon at all times, to drain the Rangitāiki River Plains; and
- Record high rainfall in March meant that the plains area was already saturated prior to the April flood event.

On 18 May 2017, BOPRC approved the terms of reference for the Report. The Report was extensive and technical. It comprised: community engagement, a full review of all BOPRC documentation, and discussion with iwi and affected industry. It noted that too much evidence was washed away by the floodwall breach for certainty to be reached around possible causes of the breach.

The Report raised the following issues:

- The College Road concrete floodwall did not fail, per se, rather the foundations under the wall failed (the original component, built in 1973);
- Communication between BOPRC and Trustpower, the owner of Matahina Dam, could have been clearer;
- If Matahina Dam was managed differently, it may have delayed the breach of the floodwall by an hour, potentially allowing emergency works to be completed, lessening the likelihood of stopbank failure and mitigating some damage. However, this delay could have increased loss of life, due to workers arriving within that period. Managing the dam differently also may have increased the risk of dam failure.

BOPRC responded to the Report by implementing the following measures:

- Investigating how the dam could have been more effectively managed;
- Improving the coverage of rain gauges in the catchment, and providing for backup cover in case a flow or rain gauge fails;
- Focusing on completion of the Reid's Floodway project, which potentially could have diverted enough water away to prevent the stopbank failure.

Mention was made that it was not financially feasible to rely on Regional Council's ratepayer groups alone to continue to maintain flood management schemes, particularly given the increased risk from climate change.

Members noted the difficulty in assessing the correct time in which to call for an evacuation; balancing public safety with perceived inconvenience.

Resolved

That the Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Joint Committee:

- 1 Receives the report, Bay of Plenty Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Review - Sir Michael Cullen.**

**Love/Bonne
CARRIED**

5.2 Whakatane District Council Review - Kestrel Group

David Bewley (General Manager Planning, Regulatory and Corporate Services, WDC) outlined Kestrel Group's review of WDC's response to Cyclone Debbie (Review).

Along with the stopbank failure and evacuation of 1,600 people in Edgecumbe, Cyclone Debbie further displaced 300 people from their homes across the district, of which 56% remained unable to return home.

The Review noted the Emergency Operating Centre (EOC) was well managed, and recognised the efforts and competency of Controllers and WDC staff. The efforts of the Mayor and Chief Executive were also praised.

The Review noted the following issues:

- Operational Plans, including the Flood Plan needed updating. Mr Bewley advised that at the time of Cyclone Debbie, the Flood Plan did not consider the scenario of a stopbank breach, and in the first four to five days following, no one thought to consult the Flood Plan for advice, raising questions of its value.
- WDC's communication with BOPRC's Flood Team needed strengthening, along with the relationship.
- Rostering of the EOC was insufficient, with staff burning out from exhaustion following the initial response.
- WDC struggled to maintain Business as Usual (BAU) whilst the EOC was operative.
- At times the EOC did not have any WDC staff present, causing a lack of local knowledge and difficulties for the public.
- The public praised the efforts of the Council but were often critical of "civil defence", not realising they were one and the same. Members noted that, nationwide, the public did not understand Councils' role in the structure of Civil Defence Emergency Management (CDEM), and education in this regard was needed.
- WDC should focus on improving their relationships with iwi and the rural sector and discuss how they could be involved in the future.

WDC was in the process of addressing the issues raised, and was working with BOPRC's Flood Team to review the WDC Flood Plan.

The Review commended WDC on the following matters:

- Establishing the Liveable Homes Project, which assisted people without insurance to repair and re-enter their homes.
- Engaging with insurers early in order to establish ground rules, making claiming easier for the public.
- Creating a simplified and free building consent process to ensure remediation work carried out on houses was recorded.
- Assisting the public with disposing of their waste.

The Review also noted that the resourcing expectations at the local level, under a centralised regional model for CDEM, needed clarification.

Members noted the opportunity maraes offered as a safe place people could go in an emergency, and discussed how it should be explored.

Resolved

That the Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Joint Committee:

- 1 Receives the report, Whakatane District Council Review - Kestrel Group.**

**Love/Bonne
CARRIED**

6 Public Excluded Section

Resolved

THAT the public be excluded from the following parts of the proceedings of this meeting.

The general subject of each matter to be considered while the public is excluded, the reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter, and the specific grounds under section 48(1) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 for the passing of this resolution are as follows:

General Subject of Matter to be Considered	Reason for passing this resolution in relation to this matter	Grounds under Section 48(1) LGOIMA 1987 for passing this resolution
8.1 Bay of Plenty Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Review - Kestrel Group	Good reason for withholding exists under Section 48(1)(a).	Protect the privacy of natural persons. Maintain legal professional privilege.
8.2 Summary of Bay of Plenty Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Review - Kestrel Group	Good reason for withholding exists under Section 48(1)(a).	Protect the privacy of natural persons. Maintain legal professional privilege.

Webber/Love
CARRIED

Attendance:

Chairman Leeder entered the meeting at 1.44pm

7 Restatement in open meeting

Resolved

That the Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Joint Committee:

- 1 That Public Excluded item 8.1 be transferred into the open at the conclusion of the meeting.
- 2 That Public Excluded item 8.2 be transferred into the open at the conclusion of the meeting.

Love/Webber
CARRIED

8 Reports Continued

8.1 Civil Defence Emergency Management Local Controller Amendments

Clinton Naude (Director, EMBOP) explained the requirements under section 27 of the Civil Defence Emergency Management Act 2002 (the Act) for Civil Defence Emergency

Management Group Joint Committee (CDEMG) to appoint and rescind authority of Local Controllers.

WDC nominated two new Local Controllers, Mike Naude and Nicholas Woodley, who were endorsed by the Coordinating Executive Group (CEG), as two Local Controllers had resigned, and their authority was to be rescinded.

Resolved

That the Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Joint Committee:

- 1 Receives the report, Civil Defence Emergency Management Local Controller Amendments;**
- 2 Appoints Mike Naude and Nicholas Woodley of Whakatane District Council, to act as Alternate Local Controllers for the Bay of Plenty Civil Defence Emergency Management Group, as defined under s27 of the Civil Defence Emergency Management Act 2002.**
- 3 Rescinds the authority of Paula Chapman to act as Local Controller for the Bay of Plenty Civil Defence Emergency Management Group, Whakatane District Council as defined under s27 of the Civil Defence Emergency Management Act 2002.**
- 4 Rescinds the authority of Jean-Paul Gaston to act as Local Controller for the Bay of Plenty Civil Defence Emergency Management Group, Rotorua Lakes Council, as defined under s27 of the Civil Defence Emergency Management Act 2002.**
- 5 Confirms that the decision has a low level of significance.**

**Webber/Love
CARRIED**

8.2 Civil Defence Emergency Management Local Recovery Manager Appointment

Mr Naude explained the requirements under section 30 of the Act for CDEMG to appoint Local Recovery Managers.

WBOPDC endorsed Don Shewan's appointment as a Local Recovery Manager, and CEG recommended CDEMG approve the appointment.

Resolved

That the Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Joint Committee:

- 1 Receives the report, Civil Defence Emergency Management Local Recovery Manager Appointment;**
- 2 In terms of Section 30(1) of the Civil Defence Emergency Management Act 2002 approves the appointment of Don Shewan as Local Recovery Manager for Western Bay of Plenty District Council;**
- 3 Confirms that this decision is a low level of significance.**

**Webber/Love
CARRIED**

8.3 **Bay of Plenty Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Annual Report 2017**

Resolved

That the Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Joint Committee:

- 1 Receives the report, Bay of Plenty Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Annual Report 2017;**
- 2 Approves the Bay of Plenty Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Annual Report 2017.**

**Love/Bonne
CARRIED**

8.4 **Draft Bay of Plenty Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Plan 2017-2022 Hearings and Amendments Report.**

Mr Naude discussed the extensive submissions heard on 17 October 2017 relating to the Draft Bay of Plenty Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Plan 2017-2022. Members considered the recommendations of the Hearing Panel, and noted public interest on such matters was increasing. Mr Naude advised that once the draft plan was approved, it would be forwarded to the Minister of Civil Defence, Hon. Faafoi, who would then have 20 working days to comment on it.

Resolved

That the Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Joint Committee:

- 1 Receives the report, Draft Bay of Plenty Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Plan 2017-2022 Hearings and Amendments Report;**
- 2 Approves the recommendations and direction of the Hearings Panel on submissions to the draft Bay of Plenty Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Plan 2017-2022.**
- 3 Approves the amendments to the draft Bay of Plenty Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Plan 2017-2022 (changing to 2018-2023) as outlined in appendix 3.**
- 4 Approves the Bay of Plenty Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Plan 2018-2023, subject to final formatting, to be sent to the Minister of Civil Defence for comment in accordance with section 49(1) of the Civil Defence Emergency Management Act 2002.**

**Donaldson/Bonne
CARRIED**

8.5 **Regional Alerting Systems Review**

Graham Leonard (Volcanic Geologist, GNS Science) discussed with Members the gap analysis and critical review he had undertaken, with his team, into the current suite of public alerting tools being used in the Bay of Plenty, and their suitability.

Mr Leonard compared text alerting, email alerting (no longer used), Facebook, Twitter, Red Cross Hazard App, land based tone only sirens, and stinger sirens in use in the

Bay of Plenty, along with the recently introduced Cell Broadcasting tool. Mr Leonard found the Cell Broadcast and Red Cross Hazard App as the most effective options.

Mr Leonard and his team reviewed all known international and domestic systems against a 25-criteria “effectiveness” score, with a particular focus on their effectiveness in alerting against a tsunami. Mr Leonard clarified the difficulty in tsunami alerts, was the need for human intervention to assess the risk, therefore not being able to alert the public immediately.

Particular consideration was given to those who may not have mobile coverage, internet, a landline, radio, TV, or otherwise struggle to receive an alert. In such situations, Mr Leonard recommended a fixed in-house PA loudspeaker system be considered.

Mr Leonard suggested any option would require a sustained community engagement regime, including education and practice drills, in order to be fully effective.

It was suggested that before any further research into blackspots within the region occur, Councils’ Chief Executives liaise to understand what research into blackspots may be available, to assist with gauging how many people would not be reached with Cell Broadcasts, and similar mobile alerts.

Members noted concern for Lake Tarawera’s blackspot and the ability for the community there, to receive alerts.

Resolved

That the Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Joint Committee:

- 1 Receives the report, Regional Alerting Systems Review;**
- 2 Directs a consistent region-wide approach to backbone and infill public alerting options.**
- 3 Approves any upcoming Civil Defence Emergency Management service delivery review to include consideration of additional FTE’s to support response to natural warnings.**
- 4 Approves a regional study of mobile coverage.**
- 5 Approves a regional study of situations that may need fixed public address loudspeakers.**
- 6 Directs that Emergency Management Bay of Plenty progress investigating options for an alerting end-point platform.**
- 7 Notes that telephone auto-dialler will likely be adopted at a future time, once the regional mobile coverage study has been completed.**

**Love/Browne
CARRIED**

9 2018 CDEMG Meeting Dates

Councillor Love and Mr Naude explained they had previously met with Mayor Brownless, to discuss moving the CDEMG meetings away from Friday afternoons following the Mayors and Chairs Triennials held at RLC.

Mr Naude explained the timing of the Triennials did not align with the workflow of CDEMG, and the other meetings that fed into it.

Members agreed with the sensibility of such an approach, noting meetings would also rotate around the region, between Tauranga, Whakatāne and Rotorua, with the first meeting of 2018 to be held in the morning at TCC's Chambers.

Resolved

That the Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Joint Committee:

- 1 Adopts the following dates for the Civil Defence Emergency Management Group Joint Committee; 23 March 2018 (meeting), 18 May 2018 (workshop), 22 June 2018 (meeting), 28 September 2018 (meeting and workshop), and 7 December 2018 (meeting).**

**Webber/Love
CARRIED**

The meeting closed at 2.35pm.