IN THE MATTER

of appeals under Clause 14 of the First Schedule to the Resource Management Act 1991 (the Act)

BETWEEN

NGĀTI MĀKINO HERITAGE TRUST (ENV-2013-AKL-000068)

MŌTĪTĪ ROHE MOANA TRUST (ENV-2013-AKL-000069)

WESTERN BAY OF PLENTY DISTRICT COUNCIL (ENV-2013-AKL-000070)

TE RUNUNGA O NGĀTI AWA (ENV-2013-AKL-000073)

MŌTĪTĪ AVOCADOS LIMITED (ENV-2013-AKL-000074)

TKC HOLDINGS LTD; SCORPIANS LTD AND BLAKELY PACIFIC LTD (ENV-2013-AKL-000075)

TE TUMU LANDOWNERS GROUP; TE TUMU KAITUNA 14 TRUST; TE TUMU KAITUNA 11B2 TRUST; & FORD LAND HOLDINGS PTY LTD

(ENV-2013-AKL-000076) (ENV-2012-AKL-000084)

FEDERATED FARMERS OF NEW ZEALAND INC (ENV-2013-AKL-000077)

LOWNDES ASSOCIATES LTD (ENV-2013-AKL-000082)

Appellants

BAY OF PLENTY REGIONAL COUNCIL

Respondent



AND

BEFORE THE ENVIRONMENT COURT

Environment Judge J A Smith sitting alone under Section 279 of the Act

IN CHAMBERS at Auckland

CONSENT ORDER

- A. Under Section 279(1)(b) of the Act, the Environment Court by consent, orders that:
 - 1. The appeals are allowed subject to the amendments set out in Appendix 1 and Appendix 2 to this order.
 - 2. The appeals are resolved in their entirety except for:
 - i. the appeal by Ngati Makino Heritage Trust (ENV-2013-AKL-000068). This appeal is extant in relation to appeal point 5(f) as it relates to Okurei Point; and
 - ii. the appeal by Motiti Rohe Moana Trust (ENV-2013-AKL-000069) in relation to the following appeal points:
 - Islands, toka, reefs, substrate (and potentially water) surrounding Motiti, being those not already covered by Astrolabe Reef or Motiti Island and surrounds notations (map 21 of 35) be classified as ONC.
 - Any attributes to be listed in relation to the above in Appendix J
 are to be limited to those in Policy 13 of the New Zealand Coastal
 Policy Statement 2010 (NZCPS).
- B. Under Section 285 of the Act, there is no order as to costs.

REASONS

Introduction

- 1. These appeals relate to Variation 1 (Coastal Policy) to the Proposed Bay of Plenty Regional Policy Statement. This consent order relates to the parts of the above appeals that have been resolved via mediation on 26, 27 September and 2, 3 October 2013 in respect of Appeals against Variation 1 to the proposed Bay of Plenty Regional Policy Statement.
- 2. In addition to the appellants, many of whom filed cross-notices of interest, the parties to these Appeals that gave notice of an interest in the matters to be resolved by this consent order are:
 - 2.1 Environmental Defence Society Inc;
 - 2.2 Royal Forest and Bird Protection Society of New Zealand Inc;
 - 2.3 Mataatua District Māori Council;
 - 2.4 New Zealand Transport Agency;
 - 2.5 Tauranga City Council; and
 - 2.6 Port of Tauranga Ltd.
- 3. In making this order the Court has read and considered the above appeals and the memoranda of the parties dated 16 December 2013 and 27 June 2014.
- 4. The Court is making this order under section 279(1)(b) of the Act, such order being by consent, rather than representing a decision or determination on the merits pursuant to section 279. The Court understands for the present purpose that:
 - 4.1 All parties to the proceedings with an interest in these appeals have executed the memorandum requesting this order.

4.2 All parties are satisfied that all matters proposed for the Court's endorsement fall within the Court's jurisdiction, and conform to the relevant requirements and objectives of the Resource Management Act, including in particular Part 2.

Order

- 5. Therefore the Court orders by consent that:
 - 5.1 The Proposed Bay of Plenty Regional Policy Statement, as amended by proposed Variation 1, is amended as set out in **Appendix 1** to this order.
 - 5.2 The RPS maps numbered 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 23, 24 and 25 are directed to be amended to reflect those attached as **Appendix 2** to this order.
- 6. This consent order disposes of the relief sought in relation to the appeals as outlined below:
 - 6.1 Western Bay of Plenty District Council (ENV-2013-AKL-000070). This appeal is disposed of in its entirety;
 - 6.2 **Motītī Avocados Limited** (ENV-2013-AKL-000074). This appeal is disposed of in its entirety;
 - 6.3 Blakely Pacific Limited & Others (ENV-2013-AKL-000075). This appeal is disposed of in its entirety;
 - 6.4 **Te Tumu Landowners Group & Ors** (ENV-2013-AKL-000076). This appeal is disposed of in its entirety;
 - 6.5 **Te Tumu Landowners Group & Ors** (ENV-2012-AKL-000084). This appeal is disposed of in its entirety;
 - 6.6 **Ngāti Mākino Heritage Trust** (ENV-2013-AKL-000068). This appeal is disposed of except for paragraph 5(f) which remains extant;
 - 6.7 **Te Rununga O Ngāti Awa** (ENV-2013-AKL-000073). This appeal is disposed of in its entirety;

- 6.8 **Lowndes Associates Ltd** (ENV-2013-AKL-000082). This appeal is disposed of in its entirety;
- 6.9 **Mōtītī Rohe Moana Trust** (ENV-2013-AKL-000069). This appeal remains extant in relation to the following appeal points:
 - Islands, toka, reefs, substrate (and potentially water) surrounding Motiti, being those not already covered by Astrolabe Reef or Motiti Island and surrounds notations (map 21 of 35) be classified as ONC.
 - Any attributes to be listed in relation to the above in Appendix J are to be limited to those in Policy 13 of the New Zealand Coastal Policy Statement 2010 (NZCPS).
- 6.10 Federated Farmers of New Zealand Inc (ENV-2013-AKL-000077). This appeal is resolved in its entirety.
- 7. There is no order as to costs in relation to this order.

DATED at Auckland this

15+

day of

July

2014

J A Smith

Environment Judge

APPENDIX 1

The Proposed Bay of Plenty Regional Policy Statement, as amended by proposed Variation 1, is amended as shown below, with <u>underline</u> (for additions) and <u>strike</u> through (for deletions).

2.2.1 Integrated management of the coastal environment

There are several challenges to achieving integrated management of the coastal environment. Although mean high water springs (MHWS) is the jurisdictional boundary between district and regional councils, it does not mark the extent of the coastal environment. [...].

Objectives and policies directing integrated management of the coastal environment are located in the Integrated Resource Management topic area.

The management of growth in the western Bay of Plenty sub-region has been provided for through the Urban and Rural Growth Management policies and methods and in section 2.9. In order to achieve an integrated management approach to urban development in these areas, as required under section 30(1)(a) of the Act, it is appropriate that all relevant objectives and policies be considered together to provide for sustainable growth of the sub-region and give effect to this Regional Policy Statement.
[...]

2.2.2 Natural character and the ecological functioning of the coastal environment

Natural character of the coastal environment exists on a spectrum from heavily modified "low" natural character as would be experienced in some coastal settlements through "high" for areas such as Ōkurei Point which still possess elements of pristineness to pristine "outstanding" natural character remaining on some offshore islands and Through "high" "outstanding" natural character remaining on some offshore islands and Through "high" "outstanding" natural character remaining on some offshore islands and Through "high" "outstanding" natural character remaining on some offshore islands and Through "high" "outstanding" natural character remaining on some offshore islands and Through "high" "outstanding" natural character remaining on some offshore islands and Through "high" "outstanding" natural character remaining on some offshore islands and Through "high" "outstanding" natural character remaining on some offshore islands and Through "high" "outstanding" natural character remaining on some offshore islands and Through "high" "outstanding" natural character remaining on some offshore islands and Through "high" "outstanding" natural character remaining outstanding" natural character remaining outstanding natural character remaining natural character remaining

While the Bay of Plenty Coast Care and Estuary Care groups are making significant progress in restoring the form and function of the region's dune systems and estuaries, the natural character of the coast continues to face challenges from incremental loss and degradation in the face of pressure to meet the demands of the growing population.

In some cases there is an opportunity to make provision for enhancement of the coastal environment including through appropriately planned use and development.

[....]

2.2.3 Use and allocation of coastal resources

Coastal use and development can also result in conflict and competition for space, where uses and activities are not compatible or are not managed proactively and effectively. Management of coastal space to avoid conflicts, protect the rights of existing and lawfully established uses, retain amenity values and meet safety and navigation requirements is crucial and requires direction on which activities take priority, as well as guidance on managing the cumulative effects of coastal development. This can be achieved by providing direction (including in resource management planning documents) on the appropriate location and form of use and development within the coastal environment, encouraging development in areas where the natural character has already been highly compromised (except where areas and opportunities for restoration and rehabilitation have been identified and constraining development on undeveloped land (except where land has been identified as an appropriate location of future urban growth within Appendix D and E).

2.2.5 Regionally significant coastal environment issues

Significant adverse effects on the natural character and ecological functioning of the coastal environment

The natural character and ecological functioning of the region's coastal environment is adversely affected by inappropriate land use and development, hazard mitigation works, earthworks, recreational activities, encroachment, grazing, changes in land use and the presence of pest plants and animals.

[...]

Policy CE2B Managing adverse effects on natural character within the coastal environment

[...]

Explanation

Policy CE 2B comprises three parts. Part (a) requires the complete avoidance of adverse effects of inappropriate activities on the attributes of areas of the coastal environment with "outstanding" natural character. These areas are mapped in Appendix I. Part (b) requires avoidance of significant adverse effects on attributes comprising natural character in all other areas and that activities avoid, remedy or mitigate adverse effects on the natural character attributes of all areas of the coastal environment. Part (c) clarifies the natural character status of open coastal water and Policy 13 of the NZCPS 2010 will apply, recognising the blanket ranking of the open coast may require site specific assessment.

Policy CE 7B:Ensuring subdivision, use and development is appropriate to the natural character of the coastal environment

When assessing the effect of subdivision, use and development on the natural character of the coastal environment, particular regard shall be given to:

- (a) The level of natural character as shown in Maps in Appendix I, as described in Appendix J, and the level of protection to be afforded by Policy CE 2B;
- [...]
- (d) Avoiding the introduction or accumulation of man-made elements where none are planned (consented, zoned or designated) or were previously present or obvious; and
- (d) The appropriateness of the introduction or accumulation of man-made modifications, recognising activities that are:
 - i) planned (consented, zoned or designated);
 - ii) provided for in reserve management plans; or
 - iii) identified in Appendix C, D and E; or
 - iv) lawfully established;
- (da) the provisions of Customary Marine Title Management Plans;
- (g) Setting buildings and structures back from the coastal marine area and other waterbodies where necessary, practicable and <u>appropriate reasonable to protect</u> natural character, open space, public access and amenity values of the coastal environment, while recognising <u>marine-some</u> structures_may have a functional need to be located in the coastal environment, for which a setback would be inappropriate.

Explanation

Policy CE 7B recognises that in some areas natural character has been mapped and directs decision-makers to consider the appropriateness of development having regard to Policy CE 2B and local-scale considerations. Part (a) applies only to the mapped areas.

The policy identifies particular elements, features and patterns which, if present, in the coastal environment require a higher level of protection from development in terms of avoidance, remediation or mitigation of adverse effects. This policy will ensure that subdivision, use and development are appropriate for the characteristics of the area and will not result in significant adverse effects on the natural character of the coastal environment.

Objective 6 and Policy 7 of the NZCPS 2010 recognise that there are competing needs in managing activities in the coastal environment. The protection of the values of the coastal environment does not preclude use and development in appropriate places and forms, and within appropriate limits. Sub-paragraph (d) recognises that in managing adverse effects there is also a need to take into account planned development and the needs of existing uses, such as rural activities.

[....]

Policy MN 6B: Restricting public access to and along the coast, lakes and rivers

Restrict public access to and along the coast, lakes and rivers only where necessary to:

- (a) Protect public health or safety, including a consideration of existing or reasonably foreseeable conflict between uses; or
- (b) Protect dunes, estuaries, areas of sensitive indigenous vegetation and/or habitats of indigenous fauna; or
- (c) Protect threatened indigenous species in the coastal environment; or
- (d) Protect historic heritage and Māori cultural values and activities; or
- (e) Provide for temporary activities, activities for defence purposes or special events within the coastal environment; or
- (f) Provide a level of security consistent with the purpose of a resource consent; or
- (g) Achieve one or more of the objectives of this Policy Statement; or
- (h) Recognise other exceptional circumstances that are sufficient to justify a restriction.

Before imposing a restriction on public access consider: and, where practicable, provide alternative access that is available to the public free of charge at all times.

- i. The potential adverse effects of uncontrolled access;
- ii. Where practicable, the provision of alternative access to the public free of charge at all times.

Explanation

In limited situations there are sensitive areas of the coast which would be compromised by unrestricted or uncontrolled public access e.g. trampling of vegetation or disturbance of breeding sites. In some circumstances, controlled access solutions through sensitive areas may promote better outcomes than outright restrictions (for example, given the risk that people will walk through sensitive areas

despite access restrictions) and the use of boardwalks, rope fences and signage to control and direct access may be more effective. These need to be recognised and provided for, as do other areas where public access is inappropriate for safety or security reasons. A requirement for an esplanade reserve or strip that would provide public access to or along these areas shall not be waived unless there are exceptional circumstances that mean provision of an esplanade reserve or strip would not be in the public interest. It is recognised that in some parts of the region access to the coast, lakes and rivers requires passage over land that is in private ownership. Public access over such land requires the permission of the landowner.

[...]

Method 49A: Identify areas for restoration or rehabilitation of natural character

Identify areas of the coastal environment where restoration or rehabilitation of natural character should be undertaken as a priority. Identification of restoration or rehabilitation areas should consider whether restoration or rehabilitation of the natural character is practicable and can be sustained given lawfully established and permitted use and planned activities permitted (including existing, consented, and designated infrastructure and/or provided for in reserve management plans) activities of the area, relevant planning considerations and, where land is in private ownership, concerns of and impacts on landowners. Priority restoration or rehabilitation areas, for further evaluation in consultation with affected landowners, include:

- (a) where natural character has been compromised; or
- (b) where the <u>for</u> natural character of the areas has been in the RPS, where these have been identified as important in iwi or hapu management plans; or
- (c) where the restoration of an area has been planned for enhancement through biodiversity strategies; or,
- (d) where the restoration of natural character is integral to the restoration of the entire area; or
- (e) where restoration or rehabilitation is likely to proceed with the agreement of landowners, unless the restoration or rehabilitation is the requirement of a resource consent.

Implementation responsibility: Regional council.

Method 53: Enhance the natural character of the coastal environment, where compromised

In consultation with affected landowners consider opportunities (including conditions on resource consents or designations) to restore or enhance the natural character of the coastal environment where it has been compromised, and is practicable when taking into account existing or proposed (consented, designated, zoned or included in an operative reserve management plan) lawful uses and activities occurring in the area or where it is identified for restoration through Method 49A, including:

- (a) [...]
- (j) Managing the effects of appropriate subdivision, use, development and reclamation by taking into account the potential benefits of on and offsite-mitigation proposed to avoid, remedy or mitigate adverse effects.

Appendix I – Coastal Environment and Natural Character Maps

Note: The assessment of Natural Character for Astrolabe reef has been deferred pending restoration of the area as part of the Rena shipwreck remediation program. This area has a default natural character value of "High".

[....]

Appendix J - Natural Character Attributes

Explanation

The following table contains attributes and elements. The attributes are titled: water, land cover and land use, terrestrial biotic, abiotic systems and landform, perceptual and are described below:

Water

Includes the water body of the CMA (including surf breaks) and landforms within the active coastal interface and below MHWS (e.g. rocks, reefs, stacks, channels). This attribute also includes habitats, biota and natural processes. The attribute excludes water bodies above MHWS and considers the degree of modification such as changed water courses, earthworks, presence of built structures and earthworks. This attribute also includes any previously identified significant marine environments.

Abiotic systems and landform

This attribute includes the degree of activeness of the tide, waves and current as well as wind and terrestrial coastal formation, erosion and river mouth processes including sedimentation.

Land cover and land use

This attribute includes land cover and associated land use including the composition, distribution, and condition of land cover including visible presence of indigenous and exotic species. This attribute also includes settlements, roads and other built forms.

Terrestrial biotic

The attribute includes estuaries, wetlands and terrestrial areas and is driven by ecological factors. It includes expression/appearance of natural ecological processes ranging from dominant to non-existent. Diversity of species, communities and habitats are a part of this attribute.

Perceptual

This attribute concerns the experience in seeing /feeling and perceiving the coastal environment. It includes aromas, aesthetics, auditory, sense of wilderness, remoteness, isolation and includes ephemeral human activity such as recreation, commercial activities, fishing and marine activities.

					Main a <u>A</u> ttributes (<u>v</u>	vith elements includes the	se that enhance and diminis	h natural character)	
Name	Amount	General	Elements	Attributes	Water	Land cover and la	nd Terrestrial biotic	Abiotic systems and	Perceptual
	Devel of	description	of that	enhance		use		landform	
	natural	area	describe	natural					
	character		character						

[...]

Motiti Island Margin (Moti) Map 21	High	Motiti Island is the only inhabited offshore island along the Bay of Plenty Coastline. As a flat plateau the island	Vertical rocky cliffs clad with pohutukawa and native coastal bush cover along the immediate edge.	Some permanent modification around parts of the island has occurred to provide for ferry, vehicle and pedestrian access to	Motiti Island is heavily modified for agricultural, horticultural and residential activities.	Indigenous vegetation consists of a narrow fringe of good quality pohutukawa forest with some areas of exotic species including	Excellent example of natural processes with minor modifications to the coastal processes to that have provided	Motiti Island has a part of its coastline which are inaccessible. however the mModifications
		has been developed into cropping and grazing blocks. Much of the island's coastal vegetation has been cleared with	The coastal intertidal zone displays the dominant natural processes surrounding the island.	the shoreline.	The area identified supports the interface of native vegetation cover on land unsuitable for farming, along the coastal fringe.	wilding pines around the coastal margin of the land with moderate diversity and regional significance.	landing areas to enable access to <u>and</u> from the coastal edge island.	contribute-to some parts contribute to the remoteness.
		pockets of pohutukawa extending along the rocky shoreline. The margin includes the beaches, coastal cliffs and the indigenous vegetation						
	-	dominated fringe. Where no significant vegetation is present on the cliffs, the area is up to the top of the cliffs. The small islands						

		immediately surrounding Motiti are also included in the feature.						
[] Matakana Island - Northern End (MatN) Maps 17, 18	Very High	Matakana Island is the largest barrier island in New Zealand. The coastal extent of the island forms a large sand dune system that extends some 23km between the northern and southern harbour entrances. The harbour extent of the island comprises a raised landmass that supports a residential settlement and rural cropping and farming. It is bounded by the Tauranga Harbour natural character areas below MHWS.	1. Striking coastal wetlands at the northern end of Matakana depict the historical vegetation patterns of this island. 2. Dune formation across the island and the interface with the northern harbour entrance.	1. The coastal edge of this feature is unmodified and displays highly dynamic processes of erosion and accretion of the island land mass. 1. The coastal edge of this feature is unmodified and displays highly dynamic processes of erosion and accretion of the island land mass.	1. Much of the island has been modified through forestry, horticultural and agricultural land use practices. 2. Forestry dominates the immediate edge whilst the inland extent of this feature comprises large areas of significant wetlands.	1. The seaward coastal margin of the island includes dunes and wetlands with high quality and beneath the canopy diverse indigenous vegetation that has national significance and includes threatened plant species. 2. It provides a relatively undisturbed habitat for a wide range of threatened and uncommon wetland and shore birds, notably nesting areas for NZ dotterel. 3. On the harbour-side coastal margins, Indigenous vegetation consists of mainly of the estuarine saltmarsh and intertidal habitats. These coastal margin features are included in the Tauranga Harbour	1. A good example of natural processes with no modifications to the coastal processes to the majority of the island. However, the dominant pine plantation limits the dune coastal processes and encourages accretion of the dune system. 2. The inner harbour edge has undergone some modification at settlement areas to manage coastal erosion and access.	1. The open coast beach has significant remoteness and appears wild as a result of the expanse of coastal waters along the extensive beach. Human activity is minimal. 2. The harbour extent and landward extent, excluding the settlement areas are remote and wild.

						feature. 4. The wetlands provide relatively undisturbed habitat for indigenous wetland fauna and range in significance from local to national.		
Matakai Island Open Coastal Edge (M Maps 18	atC)	Matakana Island is the largest barrier island in New Zealand. The coastal extent of the island forms a large sand dune system that extends some 23 km between the northern and southern harbour entrances. The harbour extent of the island comprises a raised landmass that supports a residential settlement and rural cropping and farming. It is bounded by the	1. Dune formation across the island and the interface with both harbour entrances, including the sand spit at the southern Tauranga Harbour entrance at Panepane Point. 2. Frontal dune profiles. 3. Native dune vegetation in the understorey. 4. Native fauna within the dune system.	1. The coastal edge of this feature is unmodified and displays highly dynamic processes of erosion and accretion of the island land mass.	1. Much of the island has been modified through forestry, horticultural and agricultural land use practices. 2. Forestry dominates the immediate edge with an understorey of native vegetation within the dune system.	1. The seaward coastal margin of the island includes dunes and wetlands with high quality and beneath the canopy diverse indigenous vegetation that has national significance and includes threatened plant species. 2. It provides a relatively undisturbed habitat for a wide range of threatened and uncommon wetland and shore birds, notably nesting areas for	1. A good example of natural processes with no modifications to the coastal processes to the majority of the island. However, the dominant pine plantation limits the dune coastal processes and encourages accretion of the dune system. 2. The inner harbour edge has undergone some modification at settlement areas to manage coastal	The open coast beach has significant remoteness and is wild. Human activity is minimal.

		a					
	Tauranga Harbour natural character areas below MHWS. The landward edge of the high natural character extends approximately (+/-) 150m inland from MHWS, with the landward extent being no further than the second rotation pines and less in some areas.				New Zealand dotterel.	erosion and access.	
Astrolabe Reef (AR) (Map 21)	Astrolabe Reef is located 25km northeast of Tauranga, some 7km north of Motiti Island. The volcanic reef structure rises some 70 - 75m from the seabed and breaks the surface at low tide. The extent of the reef is broadly mapped at points between the sandy	1. Dominant volcanic processes and formation of subtidal reef system. 2. Dynamic coastal processes occurring. 3. The natural environment dominates the reef with the only visible modification due to the grounding and	1. No modification to open coastal water body surrounding the reef. 2. The reef breaks the water surface at low tide creating large breaking waves in rough seas. 3. Reef has regional significance for seal use and fish communities with high abundance and diversity. 4. Some modification	Does not apply.	Does not apply.	1. Water movement around the reef enhances natural character. 2. The physical structure of the reef remains largely unmodified. The rock formation is expressive of the formative natural processes created by volcanic activity and the ocean. 3. Vertical rock faces, underwater caves and tomes and	1. Some level of a around the reef popular dive an fishing location otherwise a hig of remoteness a around the reef 2. Activities relate the Rena groun 3. Breaking waves across the reef outcrops with remnant of shir wreck below th waterline 4. Perceptions are natural reef sys

marine life and is a regular haulout for NZ fur seals.			small part of the overall physical reef structure.	perceptual values relate to the underwater experience of visitors.
 More recently the reef is renown nationally for the grounding of the now shipwreck Rena.				experience of visitors.

APPENDIX 2: MAPS 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 23, 24 and 25















