

Notes of the Kaituna Catchment Control Scheme Advisory Group meeting held at Comvita NZ Ltd, Paengaroa, on Wednesday, 13 March 2019, commencing at 10am

Chair: Councillor Bill Clark

Advisory Group: Barry Roderick, Dave Hurst, Graham Thompson, Nick Chater, Richard Weld, Roger Hintz, Peter Dine (Rotorua Lakes Council), Kevin Marsh (Western Bay of Plenty District Councillor)

BOPRC Councillors: Councillor Norm Bruning, Councillor Jane Nees

BOPRC Staff: Kirsty Brown (Acting Rivers and Drainage Asset Manager), Jo Heath (Asset Management Coordinator), Bruce Crabbe (Rivers and Drainage Operations Manager), Kerry Smith (Area Engineer), Tony Dunlop (Flood Repair Project Engineer), Andy Dixon (Accounting Team Leader), Pim De Monchy (Coastal Catchments Manager), Mark Townsend (Engineering Manager), Chris Ingle (General Manager Integrated Catchments).

Public: Neil Heather (Rotorua resident)

1 **Welcome**

Councillor Clark welcomed everyone to the meeting and acknowledged the member of the public in attendance.

Chris Ingle advised that Warren Webber has resigned as Upper Kaituna urban representative. He also outlined some key staff changes. Roger Waugh has resigned as Assets Manager and recruitment for the position is currently underway. Kirsty Brown is Acting Assets Manager in the interim.

2 **Apologies**

Nil

3 **Notes of previous meeting held 5 September 2018**

Resolved

That the Kaituna Catchment Control Scheme Advisory Group:

- 1 **Confirm the notes of the meeting held 5 September 2018 as a true and correct record.**

**Clark/Hurst
CARRIED**

4 **Matters arising from previous meeting**

Mark Townsend provided an update on the two actions from the previous meeting as follows:

- Geotechnical investigations have been carried out at Pamment's using hand augers and ground penetrating radar. The information is currently being analysed and recommendations will follow.
- Tauranga City Council Pond G pump. Stormwater runoff from Pāpāmoa subdivision is pumped into the Bell Road C catchment. Tauranga City Council has resource consent to do this. Regional Council is currently working with Tauranga City Council and the developer, to work within the consent conditions to lessen the effects on the scheme.

Discussion:

- A new proposal for intensive in-fill housing in the Pāpāmoa area and the potential impact on the Bell Road catchment was discussed. Resource consent has been applied for and the Engineering Team is providing technical review of the earthworks consent. Advisory group members expressed concern about the amount of development and potential issues with sewerage and stormwater discharges. Councillor Nees suggested Smart Growth might be the forum to address these concerns.

5 **River Scheme Governance/Continuous Improvement**

Chris Ingle spoke to the River Scheme Governance and Continuous Improvement item on the agenda. At the September 2018 meeting Nic Newman (Principal Advisor) sought feedback from members on how the Advisory Group was working. A report was presented to Council on 13 December 2018 with the findings and recommendations. This report was circulated to Advisory Group members on 12 February 2019 and feedback on the recommendations is now being sought.

Discussion:

- Members disagreed with the requirement for members to stand-down after six years. The importance of historical knowledge should not be underestimated. It was noted that this requirement was part of the groups Terms of Reference.
- Noted the lack of Rotorua Urban representation with membership including two Rotorua Urban representatives, with one position currently vacant as a result of Warren Webber's resignation.
- Members appreciated seeing photos of operational work included in the agenda and asked for more of this type of material.
- How different legislation and Treaty of Waitangi settlements fit together and how this impacts on river scheme management was discussed. Chris Ingle explained that the Resource Management Act (RMA) is the principal planning legislation and Treaty of Waitangi settlements can give iwi a different status under the RMA. In some instances, like with the Tapuika Settlement, this includes co-governance groups like Te Maru o Kaituna River Authority.
- Te Maru o Kaituna released its river document in June 2018 and they are developing an action plan. Important for scheme managers and the Advisory Group to have an understanding of the Kaituna River Document. The website link to the document has been circulated to members and agendas for the Te Maru meetings are also circulated. <https://www.boprc.govt.nz/your-council/council-and-region/council-and-committees/te-maru-o-kaituna-river-authority/>. Nick Chater is a Rotorua Lakes Council representative on Te Maru and it was suggested that a standing item for future meetings be an update from Nick.

- Members asked for the same from Barry Roderick on the Kaituna-Maketū Freshwater Community Group.

ACTION: Future meeting agendas to have a standing item of Co-governance and Community Group updates.

6 Ngongotahā Flood Event Review

Chris Ingle updated members on the independent review that was undertaken after the April 2018 floods in Ngongotahā Stream.

Key points included:

- Review was initiated by Rotorua Lakes Council and has 24 recommendations.
- Identifies that there is an issue with riparian plantings along the Ngongotahā (in many cases not planted with appropriate species) and also that pest plants are an issue. The system needs to be fully understood before proposing solutions as clearing riparian vegetation in one place could increase water flow and cause a new problem downstream.
- Chris Ingle is part of a joint Rotorua Lakes Council and Bay of Plenty Regional Council group responsible for implementing the recommendations. The organisations are working closely together with the shared objective of providing a safe and resilient community to live in. A community reference group has been created.
- Expecting to have a clear direction by July 2019 and updates will be provided at future Advisory Group meetings.
- There is an *Action for Ngongotahā* project page on the Council's website and members were encouraged to register <https://www.boprc.govt.nz/our-projects/action-for-ngongotahā/>

Discussion:

- In Holland no planting is allowed on river sides and this has been proven to reduce impacts of flooding and also reduce *E. coli* levels. Why are we encouraging riparian planting?
- Management is always challenging when mixed objectives are in conflict. Vegetation can reduce hydraulic capacity of a waterway on the one hand but improve water quality and native species habitat on the other. Council are moving towards planting on the northern or western side of waterways to enhance the environment while leaving the opposite side clear of vegetation to enable conveyance and drain cleaning.
- Dairy NZ has very good guidelines for riparian planting <https://www.dairynz.co.nz/media/1569767/riparian-mgmt-bop.pdf>
- Pine trees in the upper Ngongotahā catchment need managing. Community members have been pushing this for many years and have arranged meetings with Rotorua Lakes Council and Bay of Plenty Regional Council but nothing has happened and there is frustration with the slow progress. Chris Ingle responded that this issue is covered by the review recommendations.
- There is a need for some vegetation because the weak soils need to be stabilised. Ongoing and regular maintenance needs to be carried out and in a careful manner.

7 Operations report

7.1 Upper Kaituna Scheme Works update

Kerry Smith spoke to the report provided in the agenda pack and delivered a presentation.

Key points included:

- Since April 2018 have been in recovery mode in the upper Kaituna following the largest flood event since monitoring began in 1976.
- Main areas of work are repairing bank erosion and removing obstructions (vegetation) from the stream channel – 270 repair sites across Rotorua streams.
- Two year repair project with a \$0.5m budget (\$250k in 2018-2019 and \$250k in 2019-2020). The repairs are a cost to the scheme.
- Working closely with Rotorua Lakes Council, Community Groups and Fish and Game.
- Work is on schedule and progressing well. About a third of the repair work has been completed.

7.2 Lower Kaituna Scheme Works update

Bruce Crabbe spoke to the maintenance work programme for the lower Kaituna provided in the agenda pack.

Key points included:

- Slightly behind schedule with lower Kaituna work but will be completed by winter.
- Issues with access for maintenance of Bell Road No.2 Drain. Currently working with landowner to remedy this.
- Progressing with actions from the Bell Road operational issues identified at ratepayer meeting last year:
 - Western Bay of Plenty District Council culvert installed under Bell Road and feedback from landowner is that it seems to be working.
 - Additional culvert installed (McLeod's) to move flood water.
 - Installing a pump discharge pipe at Bell Road to support the pump station. Allows mobile pumps to be connected when needed to increase pumping efficiency and increase capacity. This does not preclude doing something more robust in the future.

7.3 Lowland Drainage Scheme Water Quality and Ecology Report

Kirsty Brown spoke to the report provided in the agenda pack.

Key points included:

- National Policy Statement for Freshwater Management is a direction from Central Government to Regional Councils to set objectives for fresh water bodies in their region and to develop policy to meet these objectives.
- In the Bay of Plenty work is currently progressing in the Rangitāiki and Kaituna/Pongakawa/Waitahanui Water Management Areas to develop water quality and quantity objectives and limits. This work will result in Plan Change 12.
- To support this work, and to help fill knowledge gaps about the ecosystems in the Rangitāiki and Kaituna Plains drainage networks, the Bay of Plenty Regional Council's Science Team undertook a 17-month water quality, ecology and fish monitoring survey. The study showed that overall water quality in the drains is poor and water quality, ecology and drain discharge issues will need to be addressed by Bay of Plenty Regional Council. The report (Environmental Publication 2018/05 *Ecological and water*

quality conditions of drains and land drainage canals in the Rangitāiki and Kaituna Plains) has been circulated to members and is available on Council's website https://www.boprc.govt.nz/media/2920/2018-05-drains-report-13_final-word_version2.pdf

- There will be significant implications for management of the river schemes. Currently not funded to manage water quality and ecological values and there is also the potential for all scheme drainage discharges to water requiring resource consent.
- Regional Council is in a challenging situation where they are a provider of flood protection under legislation and as a regulator of these activities under the Resource Management Act 1991.
- Council working with local landowners on identified hot spots, progressively addressing fish passage issues at prioritised sites, and supporting innovative drain management trails.

Discussion:

- Discharge from pump stations was discussed. Questioned whether there is budget available to ascertain water quality in the drainage system above the pump stations. Consultant currently engaged to do water quality testing at all the lower Kaituna pump station sites which includes testing water quality in the drain above the pump station and in the receiving waterway.
- Staff emphasised that there are going to be some big changes and challenges ahead. The Land Management Team is currently working on identified focus catchments and working with landowners to improve land use practices e.g. better nutrient management, treatment wetlands, bio-reactive treatment, less exposure of cattle to pasture during low growth periods.
- Suggestion was made that Regional Council needs to be working with DairyNZ now so the industry can start moving in the right direction and then Plan Change 12 changes might not need to be so big or sudden. The industry should be in a support role, helping Regional Councils meet requirements of the National Policy Statement for Freshwater Management.

8 Flood Repair Project update

Tony Dunlop spoke to the report provided in the agenda pack and delivered a presentation showing progress with the April 2017 Flood Repair Project.

Key points included:

- Work in the Kaituna has been slow to start as were unable to locally source suitable graded rock. Have been carting rock from Matamata and stockpiling for the high priority jobs. Now have a secure rock supply from Kaitemako Quarry (Welcome Bay) and work in the area will increase.
- 45 repair sites in the Kaituna Catchment. As at 28 February 2019 seven sites completed, 12 sites planned for completion by 30 June 2019, leaving 26 sites to be completed before the project ends in June 2021.
- Unrepaired sites are being monitored closely. Some sites are getting worse, some are starting to 'self-heal', and in some situations changes to the initially intended repair method are needed.

9 Engineering update

Mark Townsend spoke to the report provided in the agenda pack and delivered a presentation covering the following topics:

9.1 Utuhina Stream upgrade

- Work continues on extending and calibrating the existing stream model. Scheduled to be ready to trial options by end of June 2019.
- Model will be used to prepare flood hazard maps and undertake a flood risk assessment.
- Will then work with Rotorua Lakes Council on possible solutions to achieve the 1% AEP (Annual Exceedance Probability) level of service.

9.2 Ford Road Pump Station upgrade

- Preferred option, determined following multi-criteria analysis, is to move Ford Road discharge to alongside the Diagonal Pump Station.
- During consultation with iwi a request was also made to move the discharge from the Maketū Pump Station from the estuary to Diagonal Drain. Preliminary investigations indicate this is not possible without double pumping and any action has been put on hold at this stage.
- The biggest challenge with this upgrade project is achieving water quality standards required to get resource consent. Not allowed to discharge water of lesser quality than the receiving environment. Will not get resource consent if unable to find a solution. The following treatment options are being investigated:
 - Treatment wetland at pump station (would need to be 100 hectares to achieve targets)
 - Catchment-wide solutions e.g. treatment at source (mitigate losses from individual properties), wood chip bioreactor systems in farm drains and scheme drains to catch nutrients, riparian planting, floating wetlands, improved farm management practices, retirement of land/change of land-use.
- Ford Road catchment has been designated one of the focus catchments for the Land Management Team.
- Project Options Study Report and Business Case will be presented to Council by June 2019. Consenting (\$80,000) and design (\$200,000) of the new pump station will occur in 2019-2020. Construction planned for 2020-2021 (\$2.2m).

Discussion:

- Question raised as to why the existing wetland area could not be used as a treatment wetland. Explained that the wetland is administered by Department of Conservation and is designated a Wildlife Management Reserve and cannot be used as a treatment wetland.
- Suggestion made that a regular pumping cycle could be set up to synchronise with the tide cycle alleviating discharge to the estuary. Staff responded that this option is being investigated.
- Suggested that because it is such a process to get resource consent why not stick with existing pump station. Explained that both the Ford Road and Maketū pump stations discharge into the Coastal Marine Area and are currently not consented as is a permitted activity. As a permitted activity the pump station discharge cannot have any negative effects. Doing nothing is not an option.
- The issue of froth and discolouration was discussed. Cause by lignin breakdown and is a seasonal natural process and no fault of the scheme. Questioned how the scheme can be penalised for a natural process.

9.3 Kaituna River desilting

- Site visit on 6 November 2018 to observe the current state of drain outlets in to the Kaituna River, looking at any obstructing sedimentation and any changes from the previous visit in 2015.

- Decision made to focus on dredging the drain outlets, where the sediment drops, to achieve better flow.
- The outlets visited were prioritised for sediment removal as follows:
 1. Bell Road Drain
 2. Waiari Canal
 3. Kopuaroa Canal
 4. Raparapahoe Canal
- In process of engaging a suction dredge contractor to undertake the work. Budget of \$150k in 2018-2019 and \$150k in 2019-2020.
- Still looking at dredging the Kaituna River. Need to do an analysis of the sediment to see if it has a commercial value.

9.4 Bell Road Drain modelling

- Modelling has been a challenge. It is a complex catchment combining low lying land, intensive urban development and the Tauranga Eastern Link (TEL).
- Model is calibrated but not perfect. Accepted that it is the best we can do without spending a lot more time and money.
- Have not found a situation that shows the TEL culvert creates any impediment.
- Next steps are to match drone footage to the model to complete calibration, share this information with landowners and check that what the model shows is what they experienced, use the model to come up with options and then work with NZTA and Tauranga City Council on solutions.

Discussion:

- Comment made that this process is taking far too long and something needs to be achieved soon. Members asked that this be given high priority. Reassurance given that this work has been the highest priority. Model calibration is complex and takes time.
- Bruce Crabbe advised that a lot of work has been occurring at an operational level and reiterated that the work from the Bell Road landowners meeting will be completed by winter. Comment made that landowners were expecting follow-ups on the meeting actions and had not been receiving them.

ACTION: Bell Road landowners to be updated on progress against meeting actions.

9.5 PukePine Consent

Consent application has been made and publicly notified. Objections were received and hearing is scheduled for May 2019.

9.6 Te Puke Stormwater

- Significant technical discussions with Western Bay of Plenty District Council on stormwater and flood modelling requirements.
- Good modelling and analysis required to inform any upgrade recommendations.
- Expectation is that Western Bay of Plenty District Council will pay a portion of any upgrade costs.
- A lot of in-fill housing occurring in Te Puke and this can be done without any input from Regional Council.
- River scheme rating system is out of date and needs review. There has been a lot of development and new subdivisions, and people benefiting from flood protection are not necessarily paying targeted rates. Also need to be reviewing levels of service because of land use changes.

10 Finance report

Andy Dixon spoke to the finance report provided in the agenda pack giving an overview of the scheme's revenue and expenditure for the first seven months to 31 January 2019.

Key points included:

- The scheme has high reserve balances and is in a good financial position.
- Reserves are being used to limit rate increases.
- Interest rates continue to be low and indications from the Reserve Bank are that low rates will continue for at least another year. This is good news for the outstanding scheme loans of \$3.8m.

12:30 pm - meeting adjourned for lunch

12:50 pm - meeting reconvened

11 General business

11.1 Bylaw and policy reviews

Chris Ingle spoke to the report provided in the agenda pack.

Key points included:

Floodway and Drainage Bylaw Review

- Floodway and Drainage Bylaw 2008 due to be reviewed (required to be reviewed every ten years).
- Most aspects of the review will be technical, ensuring that rules are up-to-date with best practice drain management and current engineering requirements.
- The revised Bylaw will be open for public consultation and the river scheme advisory groups will be a key component of this.
- Public consultation is intended to commence early in 2020 with the new Bylaw adopted in June 2020.

River Scheme Rates Review

- Kaituna Advisory Group members requested a rating review for the Kaituna catchment in their Long Term Plan submission in 2018.
- Council is looking at the fairness of the current rating system and is scoping and prioritising schemes for a rating review.
- First review to start next financial year.

11.2 Submission to Western Bay of Plenty District Council draft Catchment Management Plan

Kirsty Brown summarised Regional Council's submission on the Western Bay of Plenty District Council's draft management plan.

- Submission made in November 2018.
- Main submission point was that there has been no assessment of the effects on the Kaituna Catchment Control Scheme or how Western Bay of Plenty District Council intends to mitigate the effects.
- The Catchment Management Plan has now been submitted to Bay of Plenty Regional Council to support Western Bay of Plenty District Council's application for a comprehensive stormwater consent.

- Next step, and opportunity for further input, will be when the consent application is publically notified.

11.3 Other

Questions from members were discussed and responded to:

- Feedback provided that Marshall and Armer pumps have improved things a lot. Operation is still manual at the moment and working on getting telemetry set up.
- Culvert on Cruickshank's flowing into Diagonal Drain use to have a floodgate but it was removed during the last upgrade. Following the Christmas event it took four days for the water to drain which is longer than usual.
- Comment made that there has not been any landowner involvement in the Ford Road Pump Station upgrade. Group advised that consultation is not at that stage yet. Consulting with iwi first, then directly affected landowners and then other stakeholders.
- The effect of changing land use needs more of a focus in planning and management. Urban development is having a huge impact on the scheme and experiencing big impacts from not so extreme events. Council is very aware of land use changes and the last Asset Management Plan update included land use as a key issue for management of the river schemes.
- Update on Kaituna Re-diversion. Pim de Monchy responded that 60% through the project, ahead of schedule and on budget. Project completion expected June 2020.
- Observation made that floodgates are not opening at low tide because of the silt in the Kaituna River. Bruce Crabbe responded that it should flush every tide cycle and would only be an issue if silt was burying the gate.
- Progress update on installation of fish friendly flood gates. Process is that all new floodgates are fish-friendly and also slowly upgrading floodgates in catchment areas where sustainable fish populations are present.

ACTIONS:

- ***Investigate need for floodgate on culvert from Cruickshank's Drain into Diagonal Drain.***
- ***Investigate floodgates not opening at low tide.***

Meeting closed at 1:40 pm